	Case	1:03-m	<u>ıd-0157</u>	<u> </u>	<u>N D</u>	ocumen	<u>t 9229-1</u>	Filed 07	7/21/23	Page 1	of 11		
	Case	1:03-m	nd-0157	O-GBD-S					7/21/23	Page 1	of 11		
Exhibit 1													

```
1
                 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
                 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
 2
 3
     IN RE: TERRORIST ATTACKS ) 03-MDL-1570 (GBD) (SN)
     ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2001
                                 )
 4
                                  )
 5
 6
 7
 8
                     Tuesday, July 13, 2021
9
10
                   THIS TRANSCRIPT CONTAINS
                    CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL
11
12
13
      Remote video-recorded deposition of JONATHAN M.
    WINER, held at the location of the witness,
14
    commencing at 10:04 a.m., on the above date, before
    Debra A. Dibble, Certified Court Reporter,
15
    Registered Diplomate Reporter, Certified Realtime
    Captioner, Certified Realtime Reporter and Notary
    Public.
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
                   GOLKOW LITIGATION SERVICES
                877.370.DEPS | fax 917.591.5672
24
                        deps@golkow.com
25
```

- 1 A. I don't know. It would --
- Q. But there was definitely before --
- 3 A. Somewhere between the period of 1989 and
- 4 1994.
- 5 Q. '94. Okay.
- 6 And you said that you relied on the
- 7 forensic accountant and -- to run your expertise as
- 8 far as assessment; correct?
- 9 MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form.
- 10 A. An attorney group that I was part of
- 11 worked -- chose to retain a forensic accountant firm
- 12 to assist us in reconstructing a record that would
- 13 enable us to assess terrorist finance vulnerability
- 14 and what additional practices would need to be put
- into place to correct those vulnerabilities in that
- 16 particular case.
- Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Was the case about
- 18 terrorism finance?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. And what type of terrorist finance
- 21 are you talking about?
- 22 A. I'm sorry, I don't understand the
- 23 question.
- O. It was a Middle Eastern finance or was
- 25 it --

- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. -- related to where?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Are you an expert on Islam?
- 5 A. I am not an expert on the doc --
- 6 religious doctrine of any kind, except to the extent
- 7 that it involves the political impact of different
- 8 types of interpretations of religion when a religion
- 9 is politicized into a political movement, where I
- 10 have expertise.
- So when you have a combination of foreign
- 12 policy, security, and religion, that's an area that
- 13 I have devoted some extensive work on over a long
- 14 period of time.
- And that is an area of expertise, yes.
- 16 In the Middle East bureau, where I was from 2013 to
- 17 2017, we were constantly dealing with -- within the
- 18 bureau and I was personally -- the competing agendas
- 19 of political Islam and various strands and strains
- 20 of political Islam, including that in the Islamic
- 21 state and al-Qaeda and other groups like Ansar
- 22 al-Sharia. And that competing with -- Arab
- 23 nationalism competing with states that would be
- 24 modern unitarian states, competing with warlord and
- 25 different types of rule in which pan-Islamic rule

- 1 was one of the strains, political strains that had
- 2 all kinds of consequences for terrorism and
- 3 terrorist risk, and having to understand the various
- 4 strands of those was critically important to my
- 5 work.
- In that period in particular, while I was
- 7 involved.
- 8 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) But you are not an
- 9 expert on Islamic terms of concept from a religious
- 10 standpoint, are you?
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection, form. Asked
- and answered.
- 13 A. I am not really -- I'm not willing to
- 14 adopt your question as an answer. I'm happy to say
- 15 again what my expertise is.
- Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Are you a religious
- 17 expert? "Yes" or "no."
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form.
- 19 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Are you a religious
- 20 expert?
- MR. HAEFELE: Still objection to
- form. It's the same question and he's
- answered.
- 24 A. I developed expertise in the political --
- Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) I just say, are you a

```
1
    religious expert? I mean, it's -- you already
 2
    explained that. I'm just asking you are you a
    religious expert?
 3
 4
                    MR. HAEFELE: Omar, you keep asking
 5
          and repeating the same answer he gave.
 6
                    MR. MOHAMMEDI: He already answer a
 7
          question that was not really what I was
 8
          asking. I'm just asking if you are a
 9
          religious expert.
10
         Α.
               I can answer it this way: My father was
11
    a medical researcher in cardiovascular disease and
12
    learned some fundamental principles in connection
13
    with the angiotensin system. He was an expert in
14
    that area. He was also a doctor. He was not an
15
    expert in glioblastoma. So if you're asking
16
    somebody are you an expert in medicine, well, yes,
17
    my father was a medical expert, a medical expert
    with certain areas of expertise.
18
19
                I have certain areas of expertise. Am I
20
    a religious expert who spent my life on Islam,
21
    Christianity, Judaism, Buddhism, Bahaism, Sufism,
22
    the difference between Sunni and Shia, I have not
23
    spent my lifetime on it, although I could give you
24
    the basics of the Sunni/Shia split if it was of help
25
    to you. I could discuss when Wahhabism originated
```

```
1 and when the modern Salafi movement originated, and
```

- 2 the fact that some people think its antecedents go
- 3 back earlier and foundations for it earlier. I can
- 4 talk about the relationship between Egypt and
- 5 Saudi Arabia in competing for religious dominance.
- 6 But does that make me an expert in religion? No.
- 7 MR. GOETZ: Objection, nonresponsive,
- 8 move to strike.
- 9 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Do you hold yourself
- 10 as a religious expert in this case?
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form.
- MR. MOHAMMEDI: Just answer this
- 13 "yes" or "no."
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection, you can't
- demand a "yes" or "no" answer.
- MR. MOHAMMEDI: Robert, you can stop
- interjecting.
- THE WITNESS: I believe I've answered
- 19 the question.
- Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Are you an expert on
- 21 religion in this case?
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form,
- asked and answered multiple times.
- A. I am expert on the political aspects of
- 25 Islam and how it played out in the region in the

- 1 1980s, 1990s, and 00s.
- Q. Are you an expert in Islamic terms and
- 3 concepts?
- 4 A. I know about a few of them. Not all of
- 5 them.
- 6 Q. Are you an expert --
- 7 Knowing is not an expert. Do you agree
- 8 with me?
- 9 MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form,
- 10 argumentative.
- 11 A. I think it's really up to others to
- 12 determine the scope of my expertise. I felt
- 13 comfortable and continue to feel comfortable
- 14 answering questions that were posed to me in my
- 15 expert report.
- Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Okay. Then we go to
- 17 the next point.
- 18 (Reporter clarification.)
- 19 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) Are you an expert on
- 20 the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia history?
- 21 A. I know a fair amount about the Kingdom of
- 22 Saudi Arabia. I dealt with issues relating to it
- every day in my last work, the state departments. I
- 24 was not personally responsible for that
- 25 relationship, but I was in meetings each morning

- 1 0. Is that correct?
- 2 A. That's my understanding of when they say:
- 3 Who was behind the biological crisis which became
- 4 like brainwashing? A Jew. And it goes on from
- 5 there, and they talk about why are you so miserly
- 6 with your blood.
- 7 Q. Okay. So to you that is --
- 8 A. Teach our children to love taking revenge
- 9 on the Jews and the oppressors.
- 10 Q. Do you agree that there are hatred
- 11 statements made all over the world?
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection.
- 13 A. I'm not in a position to discuss -- to
- 14 opine on hatred statements all over the world. This
- is calling for revenge on the Jews.
- 16 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) And you are saying
- 17 that WAMY text specifically said that we are
- 18 justifying the killing of nonbelievers?
- 19 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. We'll move on.
- 21 I'm just going to ask you another
- 22 question. You are not a religious expert, are you?
- 23 A. We've discussed this issue earlier.
- 24 You've asked me this question. I understand a
- 25 religion in a political context when religion is

- 1 used for political purposes as part of my
- 2 understanding of relationships among states, as part
- 3 of my understanding of terrorism. We had national
- 4 and global security issues. And so in that context,
- 5 yes. In the context of various religious doctrines,
- 6 intrareligious discussions of text, there are people
- 7 who spend their lifetimes as religious scholars, and
- 8 that has not been my work.
- 9 Q. And you're referring -- is it fair that
- 10 you are referring to a document that's expressed
- 11 religious views of an organization, and you are
- 12 making the -- you are reaching the conclusion that
- 13 was calling for justifying the killing of
- 14 nonbelievers; correct?
- MR. HAEFELE: Objection to form.
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. (BY MR. MOHAMMEDI) You understand the
- 18 meaning of jihad?
- 19 A. It has multiple meanings.
- Q. Okay. Do you understand the meaning of
- 21 Salafis?
- 22 A. I believe so.
- Q. You do? And are you testifying as an
- 24 expert here to discuss jihad and Salafis?
- 25 A. Only in the context of the political

1 CERTIFICATE	
2 I, DEBRA A. DIBBLE, Registered Diplomate	
Reporter, Certified Realtime Reporter, Certified	F
3 Court Reporter and Notary Public, do hereby cert	
that prior to the commencement of the examination	_
4 JONATHAN M. WINER was duly sworn by me to testif	•
the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the	-7 00
5 truth.	
6 I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that the foregoing is	z a
verbatim transcript of the testimony as taken	<i>3</i>
7 stenographically by and before me at the time, p	olace
and on the date hereinbefore set forth, to the k	-
8 of my ability.	Jest
01	ח
9 I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that pursuant to FRCE Rule 30, signature of the witness was not reques	
by the witness or other party before the conclus	
of the deposition.	21011
11	
I DO FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither a	
	a f
any of the parties to this action, and that I am 13 neither a relative nor employee of such attorney	
neither a relative nor employee of such attorney counsel, and that I am not financially interested	_
14 the	eu III
action.	
15	
16	
17	
18 Septe A. Sierre	
19 Sebio N. Sibs G	
DEBRA A. DIBBLE, RDR, CRR, CRC	
20 NCRA Registered Diplomate Reporter	
NCRA Certified Realtime Reporter	
21 Certified Court Reporter	
22	
Dated: 8-3-2021	
23	
24	
25	